Arianna Autieri
Goldsmiths, University of London/United Kingdom

Lauri A. Niskanen
University of Turku/Finland

Translating the songs of the "Sirens" in James Joyce's Ulysses

ABSTRACT

Translating the songs of the "Sirens" in James Joyce's Ulysses

Song lyrics function in James Joyce's *Ulysses* like any other literary and cultural allusion. However, in the musical episode of *Ulysses*, "Sirens", lyrics may function as music as well. In the episode, where songs are performed by characters and, *de facto*, by the narrative itself, musical allusions are evoked in the readers' mind, enriching their experience of the episode. The following question may arise then: how can the Sirens' songs be translated for a target reader who is not familiar with the music or words of the songs mentioned? Addressing foundational word and music studies research and recent research on the translation of musical texts, this article investigates how lyrics alluded to in "Sirens" perform a musical role in the episode. Through the study of the Italian and Finnish (re)translations of the episode, it examines the creative options for translators of song lyrics in musico-literary texts.

Keywords: musicalized fiction, allusion, quotation, intermediality, intradiegetic, extradiegetic

1. Introduction

James Joyce's work is thoroughgoingly infused with music. Beginning from the earliest commentators (Gilbert 1930/1955: 241), it has often been noted that Joyce's first creative calling was not literature, but music: he "would (as all who have heard him sing are convinced) have made his mark as a singer". Joyce did find his expression in literature, but music was ever-present in his writing. His

lyrical debut, *Chamber Music* (1907), is a collection of delicate, musical poetry. His final work, the thoroughly aural *Finnegans Wake* (1939), can only truly be understood when read out loud. In the work that has come to define both the author and Anglophone modernism, i.e. *Ulysses* (1922), music is omnipresent. It is overheard, talked about, and hummed in silent, inner monologues from the very first episode to the last words "yes I said yes I will yes"[1].

Joyce's poetics is one of quotation and paraphrase. In episode 11, "Sirens", Joyce makes, in total, 158 references to 47 songs (Bowen 1974: 160–211), including opera arias and popular songs. The references take very different forms in the musical episode of *Ulysses*: songs and singers are mentioned thematically by characters and the narrative; song lyrics are evocatively performed by characters and through narration.

Zack Bowen (1974: 46–47) suggests that musical allusions function in *Ulysses* like any other literary and cultural allusion in the text: they "assist in explaining, delineating, and emphasizing the points made by the characters in the text", but also suggests that, in "Sirens" especially, "song references are used as music as well". But how can musical allusions function "as music" in a literary text, where words sit silently on the page? And what happens to lyrics when "Sirens" is translated?

The aim of this article is to discuss the difficulties of translating song allusions in fiction, focusing specifically on the Italian and Finnish languages[2]. We will examine, therefore, translations of the Italian and Finnish "Sirens" episode of James Joyce's *Ulysses*, within the already complex field of song translation. Our research questions are the following:

- ‣ What *musical* role (beyond their roles as cultural allusions) do lyrics have in "Sirens"?
- ‣ How do lyrics relate to musical performance in the following contexts: 1) the intradiegetic performance of song lyrics by characters within the narrative, 2) the extradiegetic performance, or the narrative performance, and, finally, 3) readers' performance?
- ‣ How do Italian and Finnish *Ulysses* translators re-create the stylistic, musical, and performative roles of lyrics?

The remainder of this article is divided into five parts. In Section 2 we discuss first earlier research on lyrics and translation and, subsequently, in sub-section 2.1, the specific challenges of musicalized texts; in Section 3 we discuss our methodology, and in Section 4 we present the research material for the analysis,

---

1| Which may also have a musical referent: Slote et al. (2022: 1309) cite the conclusion of Monteverdi's opera *Il ritorno d'Ulisse in patria*, in which Ulysses, reunited with Penelope, sings "Sì, sì, vita, sì, sì!" ('Yes, yes, life, yes, yes').

2| One a Romance language, recognized widely as the language of opera, the other a Finno--Ugric language, characterized by very long words with melodic open vowel sounds.

i.e. the Italian and Finnish "Sirens" TTs. In Section 5 we present the results of our analysis. In the concluding section, we reflect on these results and consider their implications for future research.

2. Song translation within literary texts: surveying the field

The "Sirens" episode of James Joyce's *Ulysses* presents a special problem within the field of song translation studies. As Johan Franzon (2022: 30) notes, "a song must always be sung to be a song". Are the songs of "Sirens" sung? If so, who performs them? Song is an intermedial signifying system, and once song lyrics are quoted on a page of a literary work, it could be argued that they return into a monomedial system. But within the narration of "Sirens", the songs, performed by the characters or quoted by the focalized inner monologue narration, are clearly there to evoke music: for the reader to perform the song in the (silent) act of reading. But which challenges do songs in fiction, and, specifically, in "musicalized fiction" (Wolf 1992/2018) pose to translators?

Aneta Wysocka (2020: 191) writes about songs as polysemiotic signification systems, claiming that "[l]inguists generally agree that the difficulty of translating songs mainly results from the fact that songs are polysemiotic […] which means that their content is conveyed via more than one type of sign". Songs create meaning by musical, textual, vocal, and, when performed, even visual means. It could be argued that once a song is just quoted lyrics on a page, its musical and vocal elements are not significant for the translation task. But considering Joyce's strategies for making "Sirens" musical – through thematization, musical structural analogies, word music, and verbal music (e.g. Scher 1970) among others[3] – it seems clear that the songs of "Sirens" are often meant to be accompanied by imagined music.

Franzon (2022: 26) suggests the use of the terms approximation, i.e. "coming or getting near" textually, musically, stylistic-aesthetically, vocally or visually, and appropriation, which is "evidenced in either obvious changes, adaptations to a target context, or just a consistent styling", for song translation analysis. With each song translation, or, in our case, each translation of songs within musicalized fiction, it is possible to look at the ways in which the TT attempts to approximate, i.e. to get near the ST, and in which ways it appropriates or makes changes, according to the chosen translation strategy. Greenall et al. (2021: 29) refer to these translatorial decisions, of which level of source text approximation is aimed at, as mezzolevel strategies: "[a]pproximation vs. redoing: rewriting/

3| We thoroughly explore the theoretical aspect of whether and how "Sirens" can be deemed musical in an upcoming article provisionally titled: "The genosong and phenosong of the 'Sirens'": The Finnish, Swedish, and Italian (re)translations of the musical prose of 'Sirens'", for publication in *James Joyce Quarterly*.

domesticating/formally adjusting" (2021: 29). Approximation can mean different distances on textual and stylistic levels, as Franzon (2022: 32) notes, "[a]pproximation need not mean maximal closeness". A single translation of a song may, according to its function, approximate the ST textually as close as possible, for instance, while appropriating it musically for a different style or genre:

> A song translation can (only) attain or deliver an approximation of all the inherent qualities of a source song, but it will also (often) curate or change those qualities in an appropriation for a new performance (Franzon 2022: 38).

In the Italian and Finnish (re)translations of "Sirens", the translators are creating new performances for the songs. Some songs may be recognized by the TL audience, some may not. Some songs may have pre-existing lyrics in the TL, others not.

2.1. Specific challenges of musicalized texts

Discussing the translation of style in literary texts, Jean Boase-Beier overcomes the distinction between the form and meaning that traditionally characterizes literary translation studies discussion. Style in literary texts, for Boase-Beier (2011: 12), "allow[s] the text to do something besides just saying something", and, as such, conveys meaning in two ways: i) "through iconicity, the stylistic phenomenon in which the language used physically resembles what it represents, rather than doing so in a purely arbitrary way" (Boase-Beier 2011: 11); ii) by allowing readers to "supply" a text's meaning through "connotations, implicatures, and other means of expressing state of mind, point of view and attitudes" (Boase-Beier 2011: 99).[4] Since translators have to act on those stylistic features of the source text which are subject to interpretation, their stylistic choices are interpretive in nature and become influential in the reader's experience of meaning in the TT.

Joyce's "Sirens", however, shows peculiar stylistic features that differentiate the episode from traditional literary texts.[5] The episode is, in fact, considered an emblematic example of musicalized fiction. It shows a "special modelling of the level of the 'discourse' ('*discours*') so that parts or the whole of the narrative

---

4| Drawing on Pilkington (2000: 75–83), Boase-Beier (2011: 394) describes style as containing "weak implicatures", i.e. "aspects of the meaning of a text that are not made explicit but are left open to the reader's interpretation". These are opposed to "explicatures", i.e. aspects of meaning which are directly stated in utterances. "Weak implicatures" are subject to the reader's interpretation.

5| While the horizontal narrative development of the episode remains the norm, translating musicalized prose would at first seem reminiscent of translating poetry: "Lyrical language remains denotative and referential, but aural aspects of rhythm, tonality on the one hand, and associative tropes, figures, and repetitive motifs on the other, assume a heightened value, and challenge the referential element" (Niskanen 2021: 184).

and/or linguistic structure show 'iconic' similarities or analogies to music" (Wolf 1992/2018: 220). Werner Wolf explains that "the stress on an iconic relation to music on the level of 'discourse'" becomes significant in distinguishing texts where music is only mentioned in the content – what Wolf describes as "telling" – from "musicalized fiction" proper. In musicalized fiction "the language and/or the narrative structure show affinities with music" which are "clear enough to convey the impression of a 'textual music' in the process of reading" (Wolf 1992/2018: 220).⁶ If, therefore, according to Boase-Beier (2011: 11), "literary texts express meaning through iconicity", a peculiar form of iconicity that has music as an object of iconic imitation can be said to be *a conditio sine qua non* for musicalized fiction. In a context where language iconically imitates music, in stories which belong to the domain of "musicalized fiction" the meaning of style needs therefore to be expanded to take into account specific features that language can share with music and the domain of the aural (Autieri 2025).

The "Sirens" episode, as a form of musicalized fiction, benefits from a performative reading approach on the part of its readers. As O'Callaghan (2009: 136) states, "[t]he text exists on the page, visually but it can also be played out by the reader in a manner that lifts the words from the page and into the realm of the auditory". When their performative dimension is taken into account, musical allusions play an essential role in the reader's experience of the text. The translator, as a musico-stylistic reader, and performer (O'Callaghan 2009: 147), of these lyrics, becomes necessarily a musical "interpreter" of "Sirens. In *Quasi una fantasia* (1963), Adorno distinguishes between "interpretation in literature and in music, in the sense that in the field of literature interpretation involves understanding, in the field of music it involves performing" (as cited in O'Callaghan 2009: 144). The translator of "Sirens" will make *interpretive* choices which pertain to both of the domains.

In our attempt to consider Joyce's stylistic and musical use of musical allusions in "Sirens" and readers' and translators' interpretations, performances and translations thereof, we postulate the following axiom. At the same time as Joyce makes his prose extremely performable for all readers and, ideally, translatable, using, as he does, the language of music and arias (a language which crosses national and linguistic borders), he makes it resist performance and translation by making his intermedial references unattainable to those readers who do not have these songs in their repertoire. In other words, while it would seem at first glance that if the reader knows the musical referent, the music will be evoked by the prose almost regardless of the translation, it is certain that if the reader of either

---

6| It does so through reliance on "word music" and music structural analogies, (cf. Scher 1970; Wolf 1992/2018). We will not be able to discuss these features in detail in this context.

the ST or the TT is not familiar with the song, the latter cannot be evoked in them with the most formally or semantically imitative of translations.

Julia Tidigs (2020: 187) considers this "borderzone" of multilingualism and intermediality with regard to the Swedish-Finnish musicalized fiction of Monika Fagerholm. In Tidigs' (2020: 188) view, Fagerholm's "translated and borrowed phrases [are] polysensuous connective points where the Swedish of the novel is in dynamic contact with different languages outside of it". The musicality in Joyce's "Sirens" operates in much the same way: it is recognisable to a "foreign" reader familiar with the correct context, but can be alienating to a native reader of either the SL or the TL if they do not share the cultural capital of Joyce's implied reader.

3. Methodology

Examining the rich Italian and Finnish retranslation network of *Ulysses*, in this article we will first analyze quoted lyrics from the opera aria "When first I saw", from Friedrich von Flotow's *Martha*. For comparison, we will then examine quoted lyrics from the popular Irish ballad "The croppy boy", by Carroll Malone (a pseudonym of William B. McBurney). These are, respectively, the most significant and extensively quoted opera aria and the most significant and extensively quoted and paraphrased popular song in the episode.

Our aim is to examine the following roles that lyrics play in "Sirens": i) intradiegetically performed lyrics; ii) extradiegetically performed lyrics, which are repeated and varied as musical motifs; iii) extradiegetically performed lyrics, which are performed by the narrative. Accordingly, the lyrics chosen for examination in the article are exemplary of these roles. This selection of material allows us to study comparatively the different musical roles that lyrics play within the "Sirens" episode, and lyrics of elevated art music genre with lyrics of a traditional popular ballad. It also allows us to compare lyrics whose translation exists in the target culture (i.e. the Italian version of Flotow's aria, "M'appari") with lyrics that need to be translated anew.

In the paragraphs that follow we will analyse these musical allusions, considering their effects on readers familiar or unfamiliar with Joyce's musical repertoire. Drawing on Boase-Beier's, Wolf's and O'Callaghan's assumptions, our analysis will focus on the unique combination of the stylistic roles of lyrics in "Sirens", their ability to evoke performed music and the ways in which they can themselves be performed by readers. For each example analyzed, we will then consider the different translation choices identifiable in the Italian and Finnish texts.

The Italian and the Finnish "Sirens" will be respectively examined as part of two language-specific systems, which do not necessarily communicate with

each other. Examining these musical allusions in "Sirens" and their relative translations, we hope to give a rich overview of possible approaches to the translation of different types of lyrics, in which the respective musical roles within fiction are taken into consideration. We also aim to highlight the effects of different translation strategies on readers of translated musicalized fiction. A variety of possible approaches for translating musical allusions in literature and of possible corresponding effects on readers is evidenced in our target texts, precisely because translators engaged with the episode through two very different target languages, Italian and Finnish. Much like different musical instruments, these languages have very different musical and stylistic possibilities.

4. The target contexts

One hundred years after the publication of *Ulysses*, nine complete translations of *Ulysses* have been published in Italy. The first translation was by the critic and translator Giulio De Angelis, done with a team of Joycean experts (1960). The first retranslation, by the young Bona Flecchia (1995), was quickly withdrawn from the market because of copyright infringements. After the copyright on *Ulysses* expired, another two translations were published: one by the scholars Enrico Terrinoni and Carlo Bigazzi (2012), and the other by the writer Gianni Celati (2013). In 2020, yet another translation was done by the translator and writer Mario Biondi and was marketed as a "traduzione definitiva" ('definitive translation') (Cauti 2020). Ironically, the year after, 2021 (in anticipation of the *Ulysses* centenary in 2022), saw the publication of four translations: a collaborative translation by Vio Crescenzi, Tonina Giuliani and Marta Viazzoli; a translation by the poet Alessandro Ceni; an independent, fan's translation by Marco Marzagalli; and the bilingual retranslation by the Joycean scholar Enrico Terrinoni, much awaited for in the Joycean community.

Two translations of *Ulysses* exist in the Finnish language: one under the Latinate title *Ulysses* (2012), and the other under the Greek name variant, i.e. *Odysseus* (1964). The first Finnish translation, *Odysseus,* by Pentti Saarikoski, one of the most prominent poets of the belated Finnish literary modernism and a disputed character as a translator (Koskinen 2007: 461), was published in the Tammi publishing house, as part of the highly regarded *Keltainen kirjasto* ('Yellow library') series. Saarikoski's *Odysseus* is a tightly laid out book with no glossary or notes. Leevi Lehto, mostly associated with avant-garde sound poetry, began his *Ulysses* retranslation project in 2001. His *Ulysses* is a very large volume, heavily footnoted, and with forewords and appendices, published as a rare fiction book by the non-fiction publishing house Gaudeamus.

The abbreviations presented in the following table will be used in the article.

Table 1: Abbreviations of the literary texts discussed in the article

Abbreviation	Joyce's *Ulysses*, and Italian and Finnish translations of *Ulysses*
Source text	
U:	Joyce, James ([1984-86] 2008). *Ulysses*. Edited by Hans Walter Gabler et al. London.
Italian target texts	
U-DeA:	Joyce, James ([1960; 1986] 2017). *Ulisse*. (trans. Giulio De Angelis). Milano.
U-Fle:	Joyce, James (1995). *Ulisse*. (trans. Bona Flecchia). Firenze.
U-TerBig:	Joyce, James (2012). *Ulisse*. (trans. Enrico Terrinoni with Carlo Bigazzi). Roma.
U-Cel:	Joyce, James (2013). *Ulisse: Nella Traduzione Di Gianni Celati*. (trans. Gianni Celati). Torino.
U-Bio:	Joyce, James (2020). *Ulisse*. (trans. Mario Biondi). Milano.
U-CreGiuVia:	Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Livio Crescenzi, Tonina Giuliani and Marta Viazzoli). Fidenza.
U-Cen:	Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Alessandro Ceni). Milano.
U-Mar:	Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Marco Marzagalli). https://ulissedimarco.blogspot.com/.
U-Ter21:	Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Enrico Terrinoni). Firenze.
Finnish target texts	
O-Saa:	Joyce, James (1964). *Odysseus*. (trans. Pentti Saarikoski). Helsinki.
U-Leh:	Joyce, James (2012). *Ulysses*. (trans. Leevi Lehto). Helsinki.

5. Analysis

For a reader who is familiar with the songs of *Ulysses*, "allusion becomes the underlying myth of Joyce's stories, the music echoing in our mind as we read, and the enriching tonality of prose" (Bauerle 1993: 3). At the same time, quoted lyrics in "Sirens" often play a key guiding role for the reader within the intricate musical style of the musicalized episode. In this context, intradiegetic and extradiegetic musical performances of songs are key for the readers' experience of the text, and, as such, they pose various challenges for translators.

Case 1. "When first I saw"

Lionel's aria "Ach! so fromm, ach! so traut" from the opera *Martha* (1847) by Friedrich von Flotow was most likely originally composed for *L'âme en peine*, and later translated and added to the German *Martha* (Greene/ Green 1985: 592). The aria is also well known in its English version, by Charles Jeffrys, and its Italian version (whose translator is anonymous), "M'appari", made famous in 1906 in New York by the tenor Enrico Caruso. The coexistence of the same aria in English and Italian is recorded in "Sirens", where the character Cowley sings the Italian "M'appari" (*U* 11: 594–595), and the character Dedalus sings the same aria in Charles Jeffrys's English translation "When first I saw" (*U* 11: 664 onwards). There is, at present, no established Finnish libretto for the opera but there is a mention in the *Suomalainen Wirallinen Lehti* magazine on 8 May 1869 that the Uusi teatteri ('New theater'), a project by the pro-Finnish language Fennoman movement of the 19th-century Grand Duchy of Finland, will perform the second act of the opera on 10 May as a translation from the German language.[7] This early partial translation seems to have vanished into history, and there is no evidence of the Finnish translators having excavated the archives for it.

The Italian and English versions are not literal translations of their ST.[8] Moreover, albeit both singable, they do not correspond in their stresses. Apter and Herman (2016: 16) quote the opera director and translator Donald Pippin (1998), who addressed the problem of translating Italian opera librettos, with typically more syllables, into English: "[b]ear in mind: the translator has to keep to the same number of syllables as the original". However, the Italian first line of "M'appari" has six syllables for nine notes, whereas the English version has nine, with "that" occupying two notes and "endearing" adding an unstressed feminine ending in comparison with the Italian phrasing. As Apter and Herman (2016: 17–18) note, SL prosody and TL prosody must be taken into account, but "[i]nserting syllables" is sometimes an allowable change to the music.

Case 1.1. Intradiegetic performances: Cowley's and Dedalus' arias

The existence of the corresponding Italian and English versions of the aria opens up interesting translation possibilities for Italian translators. They need to decide whether the lyrics of the English arias should be translated into Italian anew, so that readers can understand the semantic meaning of the English lyrics, or

---

7| The name of the translator is not mentioned, and the search for the Finnish libretto would be a fascinating research project of its own. We are grateful to the theatre historian Pentti Paavolainen for leading us to this information. The magazine is digitally available in the National library of Finland (https://digi.kansalliskirjasto.fi).

8| This is already noticeable when comparing their respective first verse: "Ach! so fromm, ach! so traut" ('Oh! So pious! Oh, so dear!'); "When first I saw that form endearing", "M'appari tutt'amor" ('You appeared to me all love').

whether the corresponding Italian version of the lyrics can be retrieved, and new ways in which the Italian version can fit (or not) the "Sirens" narrative context can be found. This decision comes hand in hand with a necessary decision on the *singability* of the translated lyrics.

All of the Italian translators maintain the Italian lyrics of "M'appari" for Cowley's intradiegetic performance of the Italian version of the aria:

(1) Cowley sang:
     – *M'apparì tutt' amor:*
     Il mio sguardo l'incontr (*U* 11: 593–595).

In this context, they use either the official written version of the lyrics, "M'apparì" (*U*-DeA: 290; *U*-Cel: 374; *U*-Bio: 414; *U*-Cen: 334; *U*-Mar: 291), or the version "M'appari" (*U*-Fle: 215; *U*-TerBig: 279; *U*-CreGiuVia: 360; *U*-Ter21: 533). "M'appari" is a quite common transcription of the lyrics that seems related to the performed version of the aria: when the lyrics are sung an additional weaker stress is perceived onto the second *a* of the word (*m'app'a-ar'i*). The latter choice foregrounds for the reader the necessity to mentally perform the written lyrics.

Different translation choices are made when the English lyrics of the song in Jeffrys's translation are sung by Dedalus later in "Sirens":

(2) – *When first I saw that form endearing*
     Sorrow from me seemed to depart
     Full of hope and all delighted…
     But alas, 'twas idle dreaming… (*U* 11: 665–694).

Most of the Italian translators translate the English lyrics anew. This decision can make it unclear to the Italian reader that this is the same aria sung by Cowley. Exceptionally, Biondi explains this choice in a note, "Simon Dedalus canta la versione inglese libera dell'aria *M'appari* dalla *Martha* di Flotow" ('Simon Dedalus sings the free English version of the air *M'appari* from *Martha* by Flotow', *U*-Bio: 417–418). None of the translated versions would be easily singable when set to Flotow's music. As a result of the natural expansion of translation, and the length of Italian words, these versions show more stresses than those present in the music and more syllables than notes:

Translated lyrics often make mental performance of the aria on the part of the reader difficult. But when the Italian translators, instead, rely on the singable lyrics of "M'appari"[9], the actual music evoked by their translations is also at times different from the music evoked by "Sirens": the verses used from

---

9| Interestingly, Flecchia translates some verses from the English lyrics and chooses to rely on the Italian "M'appari" for others: "–*Quando dapprima vidi quella cara forma/ Dolore sembrò lasciarmi/ M'invaghì quell'angelica beltà/ Ma purtroppo era un sogno illusorio*"

"M'appari" in the translation do not always correspond to the verses from the English version used by Joyce[10]. This choice still makes it possible for the Italian reader to mentally perform the aria, although a different music will be heard in their mind.

Table 2: Jeffrys' lyrics "When first I saw" in three Italian versions

	Ceni's, Biondi's, Crescenzi, Giuliani and Viazzoli's versions	Gloss translation (by AA)
(*U*-Cen: 337–338)	*Quando primieramente scorsi quell'affettuosa forma Fuggirsi parve il dolor da me Pien di speme e in gran lietezza Ma ahimé sognar fu vano…*	When primarily I caught sight of that loving form To flee seemed sorrow from me Full of hope and in great jocundity But alas dreaming was vain
(*U*-Bio: 417–418)	*Non appena vidi la diletta figura Dolor da me dipartirsi parve di speranza pieno e tutto in delizia Ma ahimè fu vano sognare…*	As soon as I saw the beloved figure Sorrow from me seemed to depart of hope full and all in delight But alas it was vain to dream
(*U*-Cre-GiuVia: 362–363)	*La prima volta che scorsi la seducente figura Il dolor sembrava da me dissolversi Pieno di speranza e assai felice Ma ahimé, sognavamo oziosamente…*	The first time that I saw the charming figure Sorrow seemed from me to dissolve Full of hope and very happy But alas we were dreaming in idleness

The Finnish TTs display two different strategies for the quoted lyrics. The re-translator Lehto offers his own newly translated lyrics of Jeffrys' English version of the aria in his appendices, Appendix 5: "Four songs". For the first translation, the 'Yellow library' series format, in which Saarikoski's translation was published, does not allow him to use any appendices or footnotes to explain or translate the references, so his newly translated aria lyrics are revealed as they are quoted in the text.

Even though the Finnish translations cannot refer to pre-existing Finnish lyrics for Flotow's aria, the song and its Italian beginning are thematically introduced

---

('When first I saw that dear form/ sorrow seemed to leave me/ *m'invaghì quell'angelica beltà*/ But unfortunately it was an illusory dream', *U*-Fle 216–17).

10| The first four verses mentioned in "Sirens" are the first two lines of stanza one and the first lines of stanzas two and three of the English text. De Angelis, Celati and Marzagalli, instead, quote variously from the first two lines of stanzas one and two of the Italian aria, while Terrinoni and Bigazzi and Terrinoni's 2021 retranslation quote the first, third and last line of stanza one and the first of stanza two.

in the episode (Cowley sings the Italian words of the aria in both of the TTs as in the ST – Lehto offers a Finnish translation of it in his footnotes). Therefore, when the newly translated Finnish lyrics appear in italics in the first Finnish translation, the TT reader is expecting the lyrics to fit Flotow's melody, if they are familiar with it.

Table 3: Jeffrys' lyrics "When first I saw" in two Finnish versions

	Saarikoski's and Lehto's versions	Gloss translation (by LaN)
(*O*-Saa: 268–269)	*Kun ensi kerran näin rakkaimpani* *Oli minulta huolet ja murheet poissa* *Olin toivoa täynnä ja riemuissani* *Mutta ah, untahan se olikin kaikki…*	When I saw my beloved for the first time My worries and sorrows were gone I was full of hope and joy But ah, it was all a dream…
(*U*-Leh: 313-314)	*Kun hahmons armaan ensi kerran näin* *Niin murhe multa se kaikkos pois* *Toivoa täynnä niin, ja riemuinen* *Vaan suotta, ah! ma henest unel-moin…*	When her form beloved first time I saw So sorrow from me it all went away So full of hope, and so joyful But in vain, ah! I dream of her…

Is Saarikoski's Finnish translation singable to Flotow's tune? The first line, potentially. The first Finnish translation of the line has ten syllables, but it shares four stressed syllables and the feminine ending with the English text ("When first I saw that form endearing") and could be sung to the musical phrase. But already the second line would be impossible to fit within the melody, as is the case with what would be the first lines of the second and third stanzas. For the reading experience, however, the direct quotation is conveyed by the line dash and italics, and the music has been evoked by the Italian lyrics to those readers equipped to make the association, so a musical reading of a Finnish TT reader could be imagined.

The second Finnish translator, Lehto, explains in his footnotes that the song is Lionel's aria and that the lyrics are taken from Charles Jeffrys' English version. He gives a plot summary of the opera and refers to his own newly translated lyrics in Appendix 5, where the first line of the third stanza is translated as "vaan turhaa vain, ah! oli unta tuo" ('but it was, ah! just a dream'). Surprisingly, in the main text of the novel, Lehto translates the aria lyrics in a different way (see Table 3). Both translations are too long for the English ST line and the musical phrase, but the line appearing in the main text is more plausibly singable, as it only has four stresses.

Case 1.2. Extradiegetic performances: repetition and variation

When the lyrics become the object of repetition and variation in the episode, acting as musical motifs, as is the case with other phrases from the introduction of "Sirens", often an exact equivalence between the use of lyrics in "Sirens" and in the target language is not achievable. In this context, translators are apparently faced with the decision to either prioritize the lyrics' contribution to the semantic meaning of the episode, or their formal repetition – in connection or not with the lyrics' musical performed dimension. Because lyrics are not italicized when repeated, it is only through an almost exact formal repetition of the translated lyrics or inclusion of the lyrics of the Italian "M'appari" that target readers can recognize them as musical allusions. However, it is when lyrics can evoke previous musical and intradiegetic performances by contributing at the same time to the narrative development that they most enrich the reader's musical experience of the episode.

A good example in this context is the repetition and variation of the lyrics "when first I saw" in these passages: "[…] Lydia said to Simonlionel **first I saw** […] Blind he was she told George Lidwell **second I saw"** (*U* 11: 1210–1212).[11] The barmaid of "Sirens", Lydia, speaks first to Simon Dedalus, here referred to as "Simonlionel" (a hybrid version of Simon and Lionel, the character singing the aria in *Martha*) and then to another character in the episode, George Lidwell. In this passage, "first I saw" and "second I saw" can potentially be interpreted as unrelated to the aria's lyrics, as temporal indications only (e.g. *U*-Ter-Big: 294 and *U*-Cel: 398). This interpretation, albeit apparently more straightforward, can enhance the perception in the reader that the episode is odd or confusing, as often argued by scholars, since the two phrases do not fit the ST's syntax precisely and are not easily made sense of. It is only when these phrases are recognized as lyrics, which are previously performed intradiegetically and which keep reappearing in the episode, that they can be perceived as musical motifs. How can translators respond to this challenge?

By analyzing the choice of the Italian translators who had previously translated the English lyrics anew, we gain a more in-depth understanding of the musico-stylistic role of lyrics in this passage. To overcome the friction identified in the ST, Crescenzi, Giuliani and Viazzoli, translate the first instance of "first I saw" twice. The first time they repeat their translation of the English lyrics (*"**La prima volta che scorsi** la seducente figura…"* (*U*-CreGiuVia: 362)). The second time they explain the passage's temporal meaning. This choice, although very effective in conveying the lyrics' meaning and form as separate entities, in part simplifies the musical-stylistic functioning of the episode, where the two roles are condensed. Ceni, instead, repeats his translation of the English lyrics ("*Quando **primieramente***

11| Bold emphasis in the quoted fragments has been added by the authors of this article.

scorsi quell'*affettuosa forma*" (*U*-Cen: 337)), repeating exactly his translated lyrics and thus recreating a syntactic friction as in the ST. Although with this choice the real musical performative dimension of the song is not evoked, as we have seen before, because the lyrics are translated, Ceni manages to effectively convey the second musical role of the allusion, enabling readers to link the repeated words to Dedalus' intradiegetic performance encountered previously, and to experience the lyrics as a *musical* voice, which is repeated like the other motifs of "Sirens" that have no musical counterpart (e.g. "Bronze by gold"):

Table 4: Repetition and variation of Jeffrys' lyrics in two Italian versions

	Crescenzi, Giuliani and Viazzoli's and Ceni's versions	Gloss Translation (by AA)
(*U*-CreGiuVia: 382)	disse Lydia a Simonlionel **primo che scorse**, "**la prima volta che l'ho visto** […]" lei disse a George Lidwell, il **secondo che scorse**	said Lydia to Simonlionel **the first she caught sight of**, "**the first time I saw him** […]" she said to George Lidwell**, the second she caught sight of**
(*U*-Cen: 355)	disse Lydia a Simonlionel **primieramente scorsi** […] ella narrò a George Lidwell **secondariamente scorsi**	said Lydia to Simonlionel **firstly I saw** […] she narrated to George Lidwell **secondly I saw**

The translators who had used "M'appari" for Dedalus' intradiegetic performance and quote the aria again seem able to overcome all of the difficulties[12], effectively maintaining a connection between intradiegetic and musical performances. Because of the shortness of the first verse of the aria, "M'appari", and its possible roles in the TT's syntax, they are also able to repeat and vary the lyrics' text to convey the semantic meaning in the ST, creating two sentences which also read smoothly in Italian.

The first Finnish translation alludes to its own newly translated Finnish lyrics of the aria: Saarikoski quotes his own translation of the beginning of the aria. The sentence is constructed in a foreign and complex enough manner. That, together with the character Simon Dedalus turning into "Simonlionel", merged with the character Lionel in the aria, is enough for the Finnish TT reader to be reminded of the melody sung earlier. The second Finnish translation creates an explicit friction between the narrative level and the quoted lyrics:

12| For space's sake, we will not examine the choices of the Italian translators who had previously translated the English lyrics anew (Flecchia, Biondi) and who here repeat the Italian version rather than the translated English lyrics, a choice which has different interesting implications for Italian readers.

Table 5: Repetition and variation of Jeffrys' lyrics in three Italian versions that repeat and vary the Italian "M'appari"

	De Angelis', Marzagalli's and Terrinoni)'s versions (emphasis ours)	Gloss translation (by AA)
(*U*-DeA: 308)	disse Lydia a Simonlionello cui **apparì** […] disse a George Lidwell **apparso** secon-do	said Lydia to Simonlionello to whom she **appeared** she told George Lidwell who **had appeared** second
(*U*-Mar: 310)	disse Lydia a Simonlionello che **pria m'apparì** […] disse lei a George Lidwell che **poscia m'apparì**	said Lydia to Simonlionello who **previously appeared** to me said she to George Lidwell who **afterwards appeared** to me
(*U*-Ter21: 567)	disse Lydia a Simonlionel **m'apparì**, […] disse lei a George Lidwell **mi riapparì**	said Lydia to Simon Lionel **appeared to me** […] said she to George Lidwell **reappeared to me**

Table 6: Repetition and variation of Jeffrys' lyrics in two Finnish versions

	Saarikoski's and Lehto's versions (emphasis ours)	Gloss translation (by LaN)
(*O*-Saa: 284)	Lydia sanoi **kun ensi kerran näin** Simonlionelille hän kertoi **kun toisen kerran näin** George Lidwellille	Lydia said when I first saw to Simonlionel she narrated as second time I saw to George Lidwell
(*U*-Leh: 329)	Lydia sanoi Simonlionelille **ensi kerran näin** hen kertoi George Lidwellille **toisen kerran näin**	Lydia said to Simonlionel the first time so/saw she narrated to George Lidwell the second time so/saw

Lehto approximates his own newly translated lyrics. He chooses also to appropriate them, and add a play on the homonymy of "näin" (adv. 'so' and 'like this', but also past tense verb 'saw'). In this way, the sentence can be read both as 'said to Simonlionel the first time I saw', recalling the lyrics of the aria, and as 'Lydia said to Simonlionel the first time like this', a plausible narrative prose sentence in Finnish. While the found-in-translation nature of Lehto's sentence is enjoyable to a close reader of *Ulysses*, a first-time reader will likely read the sentence in the latter meaning and lose the musical evocation of the former.

Case 2. "The croppy boy"

While Joyce depicted the episode as a *fuga per canonem*, and while the music modernist literature often strived for was the classical art form, there is a considerable amount of popular music and songs in the episode[13]. What makes popular songs particularly interesting to examine in this context is precisely the fact that, much like the Finnish translators' references to Flotow's aria, there are no pre-existing lyrics to quote in the target languages in order to evoke musicality in the target text.

There is a plethora of examples of popular music alluded to in the episode to choose from, but the main "pop" song, both performed by a character within the narration of the episode and, as it were, by the narrative (often focalized through the consciousness of Leopold Bloom), is "The croppy boy", a song credited to Carroll Malone. Ben Dollard is asked to perform, with his famous bass voice, the ballad about a croppy boy, a Wexford rebel from the late 18th century, who is slain by treachery in the hands of a loyalist captain disguised as a priest at the confessional.

In contrast with *Martha*'s aria, whose words already appeared in the introduction of the episode and from there onward effectively become recurring motifs thereof, "The croppy boy" assumes a slightly different function in "Sirens". The intradiegetic performance of the song in the impromptu concert of the episode is mixed into the inner monologue of Leopold Bloom, exiting the hotel bar, and functions as a counterpart to Bloom's sad thoughts on his dysfunctional marriage and his lost son. "The croppy boy", a ballad Joyce himself used to perform publicly, is also emblematic of the enchanting power of music, with all the characters in the Ormond Hotel – which is the setting of "Sirens" – being "seduced" by music (except for Bloom who manages to leave). According to Bauerle (1982: 269), in "Sirens", "'The Croppy Boy' becomes a means of release for the varied emotions of Dollard's audience in the Ormond Hotel". In this context, song lyrics' ability to evocate real music and trigger an emotive response appears prominent.

At the same time, while the song does not have the same motivic role as the aria from *Martha*, its lyrics still contribute to the narrative, inspiring Bloom's monologue, and effectively becoming part of a polyphony of narrative voices[14],

---

13| Highlighting the techniques of specifically popular music, granted in a retrospective arrangement of wilful anachronism, the novelist Joseph O'Connor (2022: 235) has compared the opening of Joyce's Sirens to the opening of the Beatles' *Sergeant Pepper* in his essay "Sgt Joyce's lonely hearts club band": "Themes are introduced, tossed around, repeated, inverted, curtailed, transposed, italicized, struck through, before the conductorial command 'Enough, Begin' is uttered from some podium beyond the page and Joyce's own Day in the Life resumes its glorious unroll" (O'Connor 2022: 235).

14| We discuss voices and polyphony in *Ulysses* in more detail in our forthcoming article to be published in *James Joyce Quarterly*.

which becomes increasingly more intricate throughout the episode, reaching its climax with the performance of "The croppy boy".

Case 2.1. Intradiegetic performance: Ben Dollard's booming voice

Only once, towards the end of the performance, the booming voice of Ben Dollard breaks through the focalized narration, and reaches the reader directly through a dash signalling direct speech (or song), and italics indicating the direct quotation of the lyrics:

> (3)   – *Bless me, father*, Dollard the croppy cried. *Bless me and let me go* (*U* 11: 1074).

This is not a precise quotation, however. Bowen (1974: 199) comments that the words in italics are slightly different from the ballad lyrics and do not fit with the rhythm of the song: "Here again the words are not only inexact, but do not fit the tune". The allusion, in fact, only approximates the end of the seventh verse of "The croppy boy", as identified by Bauerle (1982: 270): "Now, Father! bless me, and let me go". These lyrics have four stresses in a line in rising meter, either iambic or anapaest, and fit a rhythm of a quarter note, a dotted quarter note, an eighth note, four quarter notes and a dotted quarter note.[15]

All the Italian translators use italics to signal that the lyrics are sung and heard in the Ormond Hotel and maintain the playful repetition of "bless me". Terrinoni's 2021 re-translation keeps the English lyrics: "*Bless me, father,* […]. *Bless me and let me go*" (*U*-Ter21: 559), allowing the reader to effectively retrieve a performed version of "The croppy boy". Interestingly, Flecchia, who translates the entire ballad for the reader in the appendices of the novel, chooses not to rely on her translation in this context, perhaps to signal that Joyce is also changing the song lyrics here: "*Beneditemi padre* […]. *Beneditemi padre e lasciatemi andare*" (*U*-Fle: 225).[16]

All of the other Italian translators opted for a new translation of the lyrics, assuming that the reader will remember that Dollard is supposed to be singing "The croppy boy". While maintaining "croppy" in "Dollard the croppy cried" could have been another means to allow readers to connect the intradiegetically

---

15| Bauerle writes in *The James Joyce songbook* (1982: 269) that "[t]he ballad is usually sung to the melody of 'Calino Casturame' ('Cailin o cois tSiure me'), which Chappell has traced to 1584". The music can be found on page 271. Some online versions of the ballad, however, sing the lyrics "Bless me, father, and let me go" (e.g. Kevin McDermott and Ralph Richey's "Music from the works of James Joyce") showing how, in fact, Joyce's words are singable, but contain a repetition of "bless me". Whether Joyce had the first or second version of the lyrics in mind, what seems certain is that he is playing with the reader, making apparently performed lyrics subject to the same mechanism of repetition and variation to which the entire episode is subject.

16| Her own version of the lyrics is: "Ora padre beneditemi e lasciate che a morire vada" ('Now father bless me and allow me to go and die', *U*-Fle: 682).

performed lyrics to the ballad, e.g. "esclamò ribelle Croppy Dollard" ('cried, rebel Croppy Dollard', *U*-TerBig: 291; *U*-Ter21: 559), the Italian translators (except Terrinoni) all translate the word, approximating its semantic meaning and appropriating the reference to the song's title.[17]

Like the ST's lyrics, the Italian translated lyrics could not be perfectly sung on the music either, as they contain too many syllables. However, in fact, some versions maintain the same stresses of the English lyrics, albeit with more syllables: e.g. "*Beneditemi, padre,* Dollard il ribelle gridava. *Beneditemi e lasciatemi andare*" (*U*-DeA: 304); "*Beneditemi, padre,* Dollard il rapato gridava. *Beneditemi e lasciatemi andare*" (*U*-Cen: 351).

The ballad is not widely known among Finnish readers, there certainly are no established Finnish lyrics thereof. In the Finnish translations, however, the target reader can connect the allusions in Joyce's text to the ballad through the thematic introduction of the title of the song by the characters within the narration, and the description on the narrative level of the musical prelude and the voice of Ben Dollard. Once the lyrics themselves are quoted, through the paraphrasing narration, different musical solutions can be found in the Finnish TTs. Saarikoski's newly translated lyrics are paraphrased within the main text; Lehto marks them out with footnotes and references to his newly translated lyrics in the appendices. The lyrics included by Joyce require four stresses in a line in rising meter, either iambic or anapestic. Rising meter is typically a problem in metric Finnish translation, as the Finnish language tends toward a trochaic meter[18]. Saarikoski's trochaic Finnish translation could not be sung to the tune of the ballad, but, as we noticed, neither could the source text, as such. "– *Siunaa minut, isä*, Dollard nuori kapinallinen huusi. *Siunaa minut ja päästä minut menemään*" ('Bless me, father, Dollard the young rebel cried. Bless me and let me go', *O*-Saa: *280*).

As with "M'appari", Lehto refers in his translation to his own translation of "The croppy boy", given in Appendix 5: "– *Pyydän, minut siunatkaa*, Dollard kulipää huusi. *Minut matkaan siunatkaa*" ('Please, bless me, Dollard the croppy-head cried. Bless me on my way', *U*-Leh: *325*). Lehto's line is two trochees followed by a dactyl, interestingly varying on his own newly translated lyrics in the same way as the source text: "Nyt pyydän: matkaan minut siunatkaa" (*U*-Leh: 855). Lehto's translation of the ballad lyrics in the appendix solves the problem of Finnish iambic meter translation in the traditional way by inserting

---

17| E.g. "Dollard il rapato" (*U*-Cen: 351), "Dollard a spazzola" ('Dollard with croppy (hair)', *U*-Bio: 434), "Dollard il ribelle" ('Dollard the rebel', *U*-CreGiuVia: 377; *U*-Mar: 306).

18| Apter and Herman (2016: 18) describe a similar problem translating Czech song lyrics to English: "Czech is also trochaic, that is, the first syllables of words and phrases are almost always accented, and therefore almost always set on downbeats. The first syllables of phrases in largely iambic English are almost always unaccented and therefore set on upbeats".

a one-letter word "nyt" ('now') at the beginning of the line, but the line is still too long for the melodic phrase. Ironically, that conventional "nyt" at the beginning of the line is what could potentially trigger a musical reading in a Finnish target reader, due to decades of popular songs being translated into Finnish by using this convention.

Case 2.2. Extradiegetic performances:
lyrics performed by the narrative

Most of "The croppy boy" in the "Sirens" episode is performed by the narrative.[19] Fragmented lyrics occur in various places in the episode's finale. The ballad progresses in the background while Bloom leaves the hotel dining room past the sirens at the bar. Within the song performed by the narrative some lyrics are repeated, others are summarized or paraphrased, and often the line between the lyrics and Bloom's inner monologue is hard to distinguish.

Towards the end, the episode's multivocal, polyphonic structure grows into a contrapuntal composition of polyphonic musical voices, which can at times cause ambiguities in reading. A good example is the following passage, where the reader has been trained by the episode to read the sentences: "All gone. All fallen" simultaneously as both overheard lyrics and inner monologue (or either/or):

(4) Philosophy. O rocks!
     All gone. All fallen. At the siege of Ross his father, at Gorey all his brothers
     fell (*U* 11: 1063–1065).

Bloom is led to think about when he first met his wife Molly at a concert, and he is immediately reminded of the affair Molly is having with Blazes Boylan at Bloom's house while he is listening to the ballad at the Ormond Hotel. The words: "Philosophy. O rocks!" come to Bloom's mind because they were part of a conversation about a book on sensual love he and Molly had in the morning.

To the resigned Bloom "all is gone, all fallen", but at the same time this passage paraphrases the fifth verse of "The croppy boy": "At the siege of Ross did my father fall;/ And at Gorey my loving brothers all" (Bauerle 1982: 269–270). The siege of New Ross, in County Wexford, was the site of a battle between the croppy boys and the British forces in 1798. It is impossible to say whether the ballad sung creates the associations in the focalized intradiegetic narration of Mr. Bloom, or whether the extradiegetic rhetoric narration fits the ballad into the inner monologue.

19| The narration of the "Sirens" is a complex and interesting question in itself, with most of the episode being focalized intradiegetically through the consciousness of Leopold Bloom, but with the narration also beginning extradiegetically in Bloom's absence, as if held by an objective floating eye, or ear!

In this context, the ambiguity which emerges from the confusion between the lyrics plot's summary and Bloom's monologue can be either made more complex or clarified in translation.

The first Finnish translation fades, as it were, from Bloom's flashback into the present tense of the song. The first-time reader of the episode would read the first "all is gone" as a conclusion of Bloom's inner musings; the second "all fallen" looks forward to the register of the song, which follows with the 'siege of Ross'.

Table 7: Narrative performances of "The croppy boy" in two Finnish versions

	Saarikoski's and Letho's versions	Gloss translation (by LaN)
(*O*-Saa: 279)	Filosofia. Voi veljet! Kaikki poissa. Kaikki kaatuneet. Rossin piirityksessä hänen isänsä, Goreyssa kaikki hänen veljensä kaatuivat.	Philosophy. Oh brother! All is gone. All fallen. At the siege of Ross his father, at Gorey all his brothers fell.
(*U*-Leh: 325)	Filosofia. Hitsi vieköön! Kaikki menneet. Kaikki kaatuneet. Rossin saarrossa hänen isänsä, Goreyssa kaikki hänen veljensä kaatuivat.	Philosophy. Gosh! All are gone. All fallen. At the siege of Ross his father, at Gorey all his brothers fell.

In the second Finnish translation, the quotation of the lyrics remains in the register of the preceding inner monologue. Lehto has explicated to the reader of his TT in a footnote earlier in the episode that the passage represents the stream of consciousness of Bloom. This will tie the beginning of the passage here more explicitly to Bloom's inner monologue for Lehto's target reader, but the formulation of "all are gone", with its plural form, already foreshadows the context of the song lyrics that follow.

In the Italian translations, the polyphonic blurring of the voices is at times mitigated by the inclusion of notes such as: "Continua la confessione di *The Croppy Boy*" ('*The Croppy Boy*'s confession continues', *U*-Bio: *433*). All the translators translate: "All gone. All fallen" with either: "Tutti andati. Tutti caduti" ('All (of them) gone. All (of them) fallen', *U*-DeA: 304; *U*-Fle: 225; *U*-TerBig: 291; *U*-Cel: 392; *U*-Cen: 350; *U*-Ter21: 559) or "Tutti scomparsi. Tutti caduti" ('All (of them) disappeared. All (of them) fallen', *U*-Bio: 433). In this context, the translators are emphasizing the lyrics' plot, leaving no option for the reader to question whether the words belong to the lyrics or Bloom's monologue, hence eliminating any ambiguity.

The paraphrased song lyrics of "The croppy boy" function in the "Sirens" as allusions, but are also there to evoke a musical performance in the ST readers' minds. Whether the ballad is performed by the characters or, as it were, the narrative itself, the allusions create a polyphonic reading of the text, with heightened

tonality. The translators re-create the sirens' song according to their own translation strategy, either approximating the intramedial allusion to the hypotext of the song lyrics, or the intermedial allusion to the tonal aspects of music (or possibly appropriating the musicality with a new tune of their own).

6. Conclusion

In this article, we have examined some different examples of translations of opera and popular song lyrics in Joyce's "Sirens", paying special attention to the lyrics' ability to evocate real musical performative contexts and their role as a musicalizing tool in the episode. In this context, we have considered how lyrics, as a stylistic feature of the episode, contribute to the meaning-making of the episode, following Boase-Beier's theory, but expanding her idea of style to account for how language in "Sirens" iconically imitates music, as argued by Wolf. We have analyzed lyrics both in contexts where they are performed intradiegetically, and in contexts where, instead, the Joycean musical use of a polyphony of voices, typical of fugue writing in music, and motifs, makes the narrative particularly difficult to disentangle.

For each of the different uses of musical allusions in the ST we have identified many approaches in the Italian and Finnish translations, which variously influence target readers' experiences of alluded lyrics and of the episode itself. Intradiegetically performed lyrics (Cases 1.1 and 2.1) are at times translated with attention to the music they evoke and their performability in an ideal musical reading, where lyrics can contribute to "the music echoing in our mind as we read" (Bauerle 1993: 3) as we have seen above. This is made possible either through the retrieval of a target language version of the song mentioned in the ST, as in the case of the Italian translations of the lyrics of "When first I saw", substituted with the corresponding lyrics of "M'appari", or through the use of translated lyrics which could be sung on the alluded lyrics' music (e.g. the first line of Saarikoski's translation of "When first I saw"). An interesting option when a target language version of the lyrics does not exist in the target context is also that of introducing a new translation of the song in the TT appendices (e.g. Lehto's translations of the most important songs in "Sirens", and Flecchia's translation of "The croppy boy"). This option, where new translated songs are presented outside the main text, could also make it easier for translators to focus on the singability of translated lyrics, translating lyrics as music proper and not as a cultural allusion in a novel. Irrespective of whether attention to the singability of lyrics is paid or not, this choice *de facto* establishes a new target language version of the song alluded to in the ST, whose lyrics the translator can subsequently include in the TT. This can be illustrated by what the Italian translators did with the lyrics of "M'appari". (Strangely enough neither Lehto nor Flecchia use their own translations of the

lyrics in the appendices consistently in the actual episodes.) As shown, often translators may tend to appropriate (make changes to) the lyrics stylistically/aesthetically and musically, while they try to approximate (get near) them textually, prioritizing their semantic meaning. Although this tendency has some effects on the lyrics' performability, it does not necessarily impair the retrieval of music in reading, especially because readers are usually made aware of the song reference through other expedients (e.g. notes, italics, thematic introduction use of keywords of the title, e.g. "Croppy", in the target text, etc). Non-performable lyrics are, in fact, also a feature of the ST itself (Case 2.1).

Extradiegetically performed lyrics (Cases 1.2 and 2.2) appear trickier to deal with for translators. Such lyrics are not signalled by the use of italics in either the ST or the TT, and rarely are they signalled through other expedients (e.g. Biondi's footnote: "Continua la confessione di *The Croppy Boy*", Case 2.2). In Joyce's "Sirens" there is often a friction between the meaning and form of the lyrics, their stylistic role, their connection with real music and the narrative possible meanings – a tension where reading performance is often needed to overcome, for instance, the apparent non-sense of a passage (Case 1.2) or to appreciate Joyce's polyphonic and ambiguous use of language (Case 2.2). This tension is difficult to recreate in translation. Various ingenious expedients have been used by the Italian and Finnish translators for the repetition and variation of lyrics (Case 1.2), which permit the recognition of the process of repetition and variation through mental performance and retrieval of previously heard lyrics. These include the exact repetition of translated lyrics, with less attention paid to the semantic meaning of the new passage in which lyrics are repeated, the introduction of a split between the form and semantic meaning through expansion (e.g. Giuliani, Crescenzi and Viazzoli's translation of "first" and "second I saw"), and the use of homonyms (Lehto's "näin", i.e. 'so/saw'). At times, target language possibilities and the existence of a corresponding version of the alluded song in the target context made the translator's task easier (e.g. the Italian translators who, in case 1.2, can rely on the repetition and variation of the aria "M'appari"). In this case, Joyce's playful and music-like variation of written lyrics in the episode appears to become translatable precisely through reference to external music, as a common interlingual language, in line with Tidigs' (2020: 188) argument.

Translators' stylistic interpretation of lyrics quoted in the narrative, in connection or not with their musical referent, can at times reassess the relationship between style, music and meaning evidenced through reading and mental performance of the ST. As we have seen in Case 2.2, this happens through the clarification of ambiguities created by lyrics or simplification of the polyphonic texture to which they contribute (e.g. when the Italian translators interpret "All gone. All fallen" as referring to the plural subject of the allusion exclusively, making it impossible for Italian readers to interpret the allusion as part of Bloom's

monologue). Translators can similarly attempt to maintain the ambiguous polyphony created by a musical allusion through stylistic choices which are different from those used in the ST (e.g. Saarikoski's register choices for translating the song allusion "All gone. All fallen", which splits the allusion into two parts, the first readable as part of Bloom's inner monologue and the other signalling the song) or by using other expedients (e.g. Lehto's use of a footnote indicating that the passage is part of Bloom's monologue in this same example, which also permits a possible double "performance" of the musical allusion).

In all of these examples, we have seen not only how translation strategies and possibilities vary across languages and translations, but also that there is no unified approach for the translation of lyrics in "Sirens": translation choices, when looked at together as contributing to a big "Macrotext Joyce" (O'Neill 2005), expanding the original all together, have *de facto* expanded Joyce's musico-stylistic tools.

The methodology for the analysis of lyrics in a narrative here presented is devised specifically for the musicalized text "Sirens" and its translations, and therefore our article relies extensively on studies on Joyce's episode. However, we argue that an analysis of the relationship between music and lyrics, informed by an insightful engagement with the stylistic peculiarities of other authors' writing, could also be productive for analyzing translation in other contexts where authors rely extensively on lyrics in their novels. This may be, specifically, the case of musicalized fiction.

References

Primary sources

Joyce, James. (1984-1986/2008). *Ulysses*. Edited by Hans Walter Gabler, et al. London.

Joyce, James (1960; 1986/2017). *Ulisse*. (trans. Giulio De Angelis). Milano.

Joyce, James (1964). *Odysseus*. (trans. Pentti Saarikoski). Helsinki.

Joyce, James (1995). *Ulisse*. (trans. Bona Flecchia). Firenze.

Joyce, James (2012). *Ulisse*. (trans. Enrico Terrinoni with Carlo Bigazzi). Roma.

Joyce, James (2012). *Ulysses*. (trans. Leevi Lehto). Helsinki.

Joyce, James (2013). *Ulisse: Nella traduzione di Gianni Celati*. (trans. Gianni Celati). Torino.

Joyce, James (2020). *Ulisse*. (trans. Mario Biondi). Milano.

Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Livio Crescenzi, Tonina Giuliani and Marta Viazzoli). Fidenza.

Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Alessandro Ceni). Milano.

Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Marco Marzagalli). https://ulissedimarco. blogspot.com/.

Joyce, James (2021). *Ulisse*. (trans. Enrico Terrinoni). Firenze

Secondary sources

Apter, Ronnie/ Herman, Mark (2016). *Translating for singing: The theory, art and craft of translating lyrics*. London.

Autieri, Arianna (2025). *James Joyce's music performed: The "Sirens" fugue in experimental re-translation*. (Transcript 34). Cambridge.

Bauerle, Ruth (1982). *The James Joyce songbook*. New York/ London.

Bauerle, Ruth (1993). *Picking up airs: Hearing the music in Joyce's text*. Urbana.

Boase-Beier, Jean (2011). *A critical introduction to translation studies*. London.

Bowen, Zack R. (1974). *Musical allusions in the works of James Joyce: Early poetry through Ulysses*. Dublin.

Cauti, Andrea (2020). "Ulisse di Joyce, dopo 60 anni arriva la traduzione 'definitiva'". In: *Agi – Agenzia Giornalistica Italia,* June 4, 2020. (https://www.agi.it/cultura/news/2020-06-04/libri-ulisse-di-joyce-dopo-60-anni-nuova-traduzione-mario-biondi-8810939/, accessed: 9.07.2020).

Franzon, Johan (2022). "Approximations and appropriations: Making space for song translation in translation studies". In: *MikaEL: Electronic Journal of the KäTu Symposium on Translation and Interpreting Studies* 15. Pp. 25–41.

Gilbert, Stuart (1930/1955). *James Joyce's Ulysses: A study*. New York.

Greenall, Annjo K./ Franzon, Johan/ Kvam, Sigmund/ Parianou, Anastasia (2021). "Making a case for a descriptive-explanatory approach to song translation research". In: Franzon, J./ Greenall, A.K./ Kvam, S./ Parianou, A. (eds.) *Song translation: Lyrics in contexts*. Berlin. Pp. 13–48.

Greene, David Mason/ Green, Constance (1985). *Greene's biographical encyclopedia of composers*. London.

Koskinen, Kaisa (2007). "James Joycen Odysseus suomeksi". In: Riikonen, H.K./ Kovala, U./ Kujamäki, P./ Paloposki, O. (eds.) *Suomennoskirjallisuuden historia I*. Helsinki. Pp. 461–463.

Mihálycsa, Erika (2017). "The trials of foreignization: Transposing Joyce's 'Farrraginous Chronicles'". In: Paparunas, P./ Ilmberger, F./ Heusser, M. (eds.) *Parallaxing Joyce*. Tübingen. Pp. 237–265

Niskanen, Lauri (2021). *A hubbub of phenomenon: The Finnish and Swedish polyphonic translations of James Joyce's Ulysses*. Helsinki.

O'Callaghan, Katherine (2009). "Reading music, performing text: Interpreting the Song of the Sirens". In: Beja, M./ Fogarty, A. (eds.) *Bloomsday 100: Essays on Ulysses*. Gainesville. Pp. 135–149.

O'Connor, Joseph (2022). "Sgt Joyce's Lonely Hearts Club Band". In: Kiberd, D./ Terrinoni, E./ Wilsdon, C. (eds.) *The book about everything: Eighteen artists, writers and thinkers on James Joyce's Ulysses*. New York.

O'Neill, Patrick (2005). *Polyglot Joyce: Fictions of translation*. Toronto.

Pilkington Adrian (2000). *Poetic effects: A relevance theory perspective*. Amsterdam/ Philadelphia

Scher, Stephen P. (1970). "Notes toward a theory of verbal music". In: Bernhart, W./ Wolf, W. (eds.) *Word and music studies: Essays on literature and music (1967–2004) by Steven Paul Scher*. Amsterdam. Pp. 23–35.

Senn, Fritz (1984). *Joyce's dislocutions: Essays on reading as translation*. Baltimore.

Slote, Sam/ Mamigonian, Marc A./ Turner, John (2022). *Annotations to James Joyces 'Ulysses'*. Oxford.

Tidigs, Julia (2020). "What have they done to my song? Recycled language in Monika Fagerholm's *The American Girl*". In: Malmio, K./ Kurikka, K. (eds.) *Contemporary Nordic literature and spatiality: Geocriticism and spatial literary studies*.

Wolf, Werner (1992/2018). "Can stories be read as music? Possibilities and limitations of applying musical metaphors to fiction". In: Bernhart, W. (ed.) *Selected essays on intermediality by Werner Wolf (1992–2014)*. Leiden. Pp 213–237.

Wysocka, Aneta (2020). "Linguistic aspects of subjectivity in song translation (in the light of Wojciech Młynarski's works and self-referential remarks)". In: *Studia Translatorica* 11. Pp. 189–200.

Arianna Autieri
Goldsmiths, University of London
8 Lewisham Way
London SE14 6NW
United Kingdom
a.autieri@gold.ac.uk
ORCID: 0000-0003-1774-1852

Lauri A. Niskanen
University of Turku
Faculty of Humanities
Arcanuminkuja 1 20500 Turku
Finland
lauri.a.niskanen@utu.fi
ORCID: 0000-0002-5338-2124